



Agenda
Forsyth County
Historic Resources Commission
December 7, 2016
4:00 P.M.
Bryce A. Stuart Municipal Building
Public Meeting Room, Room 530
100 East First Street, Winston-Salem

I. **APPROVAL OF MINUTES**

- A. **Approval of November 2, 2016 Minutes**

II. **CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS APPLICATIONS**

- A. Jeanine Bennett, Applicant
292 & 284 Glade View Court
Noncontributing The Glade Homes and Condominiums (Lots 1 and 2)
West End Historic Overlay District
Request: Installation of Landscaping and Concrete Paver Walkway
Case #: COA2016-096
- B. Jon D. Miller-Top Leaf Cigar Lounge, LLC, Applicant
1411 W. First Street
Robert L. Gray House, WE Inventory #446
West End Historic Overlay District
Request: Installation of Exterior Signage
Case #: COA2016-097
- C. MLA Design Group, Inc, Applicant
1404 W. Northwest Blvd (Hanes Park east of Peters Creek)
Hanes Park, WE Inventory #276
West End Historic Overlay District
Request: Comprehensive Landscape/Site Alterations, Installation of Signage & Park Furniture
Case #: COA2016-098

III. **MINOR WORK APPROVAL AND OTHER REQUESTS REPORT (Enclosed in Commission Members Packet)**

IV. **COMMITTEE REPORTS**

- A. **Education Committee: No Business to Report**
- B. **Historic Marker Committee**
1. Marker Committee meeting
Wednesday, November 30, 2016, 4pm
Bryce Stuart Municipal Building, 2nd Floor Conference Room

V. **UNFINISHED BUSINESS**

- A. Update on the Local Historic Landmark applications and review process

VI. **NEW BUSINESS**

- A. Neighborhood Conservation Overlay (NCO) Review
Stratford Manor

VII. **OTHER BUSINESS**

- A. Design Guideline Update Committee
Thursday, December 15, 2016, noon
- B. Update on County Architectural Survey

NEXT MEETING: January 4, 2017

This agenda is available in alternative media forms for people with disabilities. Individuals with disabilities who require assistance or special arrangements to participate in programs and activities of the Historic Resources Commission are encouraged to contact the Planning Department at least 72 hours in advance so that proper accommodations can be arranged. For information, call 336-727-8000 (727-8319 TTY).



Minutes
Forsyth County
Historic Resources Commission
December 7, 2016
4:00 P.M.
Bryce A. Stuart Municipal Building
Public Meeting Room, Room 530
100 East First Street, Winston-Salem

MEMBERS PRESENT: Donna Abernethy, Jeff Allen, Chad Gadberry, David Hauser, Kristen McManus, Langdon Oppermann, Michael Ryden, Jeff Sowers, Tina Thacker

MEMBERS ABSENT: Jim Davis, Brent Gearhart, Kevin Owen

STAFF PRESENT: April Johnson, David Reed, Jerry Kontos

PRESIDING: Jeff Sowers, Vice-Chair

I. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

A. Approval of November 2, 2016 Minutes

Motion: Mr. Gadberry moved approval of the November 2, 2016 minutes as amended.

Second: Ms. Abernethy

Vote: Unanimous

At 4:04 p.m., Mr. Gadberry moved that the Forsyth County Historic Resources Commission go into Closed Session pursuant to N.C.G.S. §143-318.11(a)(3) in order to seek legal advice and to preserve the attorney-client privilege. Mr. Allen seconded the motion. The HRC voted unanimously to go into closed session

At 4:36 p.m., Mr. Sowers made a motion to go back into open session. Mr. Gadberry seconded the motion. The HRC voted unanimously to go back into open session.

II. CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS APPLICATIONS

- A. Jeanine Bennett, Applicant
292 & 284 Glade View Court
Noncontributing The Glade Homes and Condominiums (Lots 1 and 2)
West End Historic Overlay District
Request: Installation of Landscaping and Concrete Paver Walkway
Case #: COA2016-096

Mr. Ryden was recused from this case.

Staff Comments: Ms. Johnson presented the staff report. She also presented a map showing the location of the property and photographs of the property.

Ms. Johnson stated that the applicant requests to install plant material to a vacant lot (284 Glade View Court) in the Glade Homes portion of the development project and install a pre-cast concrete walkway that matches and connects to an existing walkway to the adjacent lot at 292 Glade View Court.

Commission staff finds the application is not incongruous with the character of the District because:

- 1) The proposed project considers the scale of new materials in relation to the immediate surrounding environment. The project installs three Dogwood trees, three Bosque Elm (Lacebark Elm) trees and additional small plant materials to the vacant lot. (*Vegetation, West End Guideline 4*)
- 2) The proposed project designs a new walkway to be compatible in location, pattern, spacing, configuration, dimensions, scale, materials, and textures with existing walkways that contribute to the overall historic character of the District. The new concrete tile walkway will connect to an existing concrete driveway that connects to an existing walkway that matches in size, scale, dimension, configuration, spacing and spacing. The project installs 145 square feet of pre-cast concrete paver walkway that has the appearance of slate tile pavers. (*Walkways, Steps, and Railings, West End Guideline 7*)

Staff Recommendation: Based on the preceding comments, staff recommends that the Commission approve a COA for the installation of landscaping and a concrete walkway at the Noncontributing The Glade Homes and Condominiums (Lots 1 and 2), 292 and 284 Glade View Court (PIN#: 6825-76-4738.00 & 6825-76-3784), located in the West End Historic Overlay District, with the following conditions:

- 1) The applicant shall receive, prior to commencement of the work, all other required permits or permissions from governmental agencies;
- 2) Commission staff shall review and approve any revisions or deviations to any portion of the as-submitted work, that qualifies as minor work, prior to commencement of that portion of the project;
- 3) The applicant shall submit the Certificate of Appropriateness Request for Certification of Completed Work form and photo documentation of the completed project to HRC staff within ten (10) days of its completion.

Public Comment

Speaking in Favor of the Application: Jeanine Bennett, 2949 Kittering, Winston-Salem, was sworn for testimony and spoke in support of the application. John Merschel, 3400 Paddington Lane, Winston-Salem, was sworn for testimony and spoke in support of the application.

Speaking in Opposition to the Application: None.

Commission Discussion

The Commission discussed the application.

Finding of Fact

Mr. Allen moved that, based upon the evidence presented in the application and during the public hearing, the Commission find that the proposed project is not incongruous with the character of the West End Historic Overlay District as detailed in staff comments 1-2 and incorporated herein, subject to the 3 conditions recommended by staff and incorporated herein.

Second: Mr. Gadberry
Vote: Unanimous

Certificate of Appropriateness

Mr. Sowers moved that, based on the preceding findings of fact, the Commission approve application number COA2016-096 and grant a certificate of appropriateness for work at 292 and 284 Glade View Court; subject to the conditions detailed in the findings of fact.

Second: Ms. Abernethy
Vote: Unanimous

Mr. Ryden returned to the meeting.

- B. Jon D. Miller-Top Leaf Cigar Lounge, LLC, Applicant
1411 W. First Street
Robert L. Gray House, WE Inventory #446
West End Historic Overlay District
Request: Installation of Exterior Signage
Case #: COA2016-097

Staff Comments: Ms. Johnson presented the staff report. She also presented a map showing the location of the property and photographs of the property.

Ms. Johnson stated that Commission staff found that the applicant requests to install a hanging sign on the exterior of the building. The sign material is plastic, polyvinyl chloride (PVC), and will have a vinyl overlay print design. The thickness of the sign is one-eighths of an inch (3.175mm). The sign will be mounted on an existing triangular iron apparatus attached to the building.

Commission staff finds the application is not incongruous with the character of the District because:

- 1) The proposed project introduces new signage that is compatible in material, size, scale and character with the building or the District. The proposed signage is 1/8 inch sturdy plastic material with a vinyl print overlay. The sign is three feet wide and four feet tall. (*Signage-General, West End Guideline 3*)
- 2) The proposed project designs new signage to be unobtrusive. The proposed sign does not cover large portions of the façade, nor any significant architectural features, nor block pedestrian views along the street. The sign will hang vertically from an existing horizontal iron mounting apparatus. (*Signage-General, West End Guideline 5*)
- 3) The proposed project installs a hanging sign for a residential building that is limited in number and size, and does not obscure building elevations or interrupt the rhythm of the streetscape. The proposed hanging sign is three feet wide and four feet tall. (*Signage-Residential, West End Guideline 3*)

Staff Recommendation: Based on the preceding comments, staff recommends that the Commission approve a COA for the installation of signage at the Robert L. Gray House, 1411 W. First Street (PIN#: 6825-65-6113.00), located in the West End Historic Overlay District, with the following conditions:

- 1) The applicant shall receive, prior to commencement of the work, all other required permits or permissions from governmental agencies;
- 2) Commission staff shall review and approve any revisions or deviations to any portion of the as-submitted work, that qualifies as a minor work, prior to commencement of that portion of the project;
- 3) The applicant shall submit the Certificate of Appropriateness Request for Certification of Completed Work form and photo documentation of the completed project to HRC staff within ten (10) days of its completion.

Public Comment

Speaking in Favor of the Application: Jon Miller, 6511 Blazingwood Drive, Pfafftown, was sworn for testimony and spoke in support of the application. John Merschel, 3400 Paddington Lane, Winston-Salem, was sworn for testimony and spoke in support of the application.

Speaking in Opposition to the Application: None

Commission Discussion

The Commission discussed the application.

Mr. Allen moved that case COA2016-097 be continued to the January 4, 2017 meeting with a deadline of December 19, 2016 to submit materials to address the signage guideline on page 57, number 3, the sturdiness of the vinyl material and to submit a better scale mock-up.

Second: Mr. Gadberry
Vote: Unanimous

- C. MLA Design Group, Inc, Applicant
1404 W. Northwest Blvd (Hanes Park east of Peters Creek)
Hanes Park, WE Inventory #276
West End Historic Overlay District
Request: Comprehensive Landscape/Site Alterations, Installation of Signage & Park Furniture
Case #: COA2016-098

Staff Comments: Ms. Johnson presented the staff report. She also presented a map showing the location of the property and photographs of the property.

Ms. Johnson stated that Commission staff found that the applicant is requesting comprehensive landscape and site alterations to Hanes Park east of Peters Creek. The project includes overall site feature and landscaping improvements from routine maintenance to new features and general aesthetic improvements. The project includes safety and accessibility improvements to the park.

Commission staff finds that the application is not incongruous with the character of the District because:

- 1) The proposed project replaces only deteriorated portions of walls rather than the entire feature and designs new walls compatible with and matching original walls in location, design, dimension, detail, texture, pattern, material and color. The project replaces damaged or missing stones from walls with natural fieldstone. The project installs a new stone wall one to two feet in height with ornamental metal railings three feet in height in a new location along Sunset Avenue. The project installs new one foot high stone seat walls with three feet ornamental metal railings near the tennis courts. (*Walls, West End Guidelines 2 and 4*)
- 2) The proposed project designs a new wall that minimizes impact to the historic fabric and is compatible with the site in setback, size, and scale to protect the historic integrity of the environment. The project installs new stone seat walls adjacent to the tennis courts. The wall will have a fieldstone veneer and will be two feet in height and one and a half feet in width. (*Walls, West End Guideline 4*)
- 3) The proposed project replaces deteriorated walkways and sets of steps with new features based on accurate documentation of the original design or a new design compatible in location, configuration, dimension, scale, materials, and textures with the historic character of the District. The project replaces concrete steps and concrete walkways with concrete. The project replaces a granite screening walkway with sandstone and stone edgers. (*Walkways, Steps, and Railings, West End Guideline 5*)
- 4) The proposed project designs new walkways, steps and railings to be compatible in location, pattern, spacing, configuration, dimensions, scale, materials, and textures with existing walkways that contribute to the overall historic character of the District. The project installs new concrete steps, natural stone steps and concrete walkways. The project replaces worn natural walking paths with new sandstone walking paths. (*Walkways, Steps, and Railings, West End Guideline 7*)
- 5) The proposed project designs new and replaces street furniture, trash receptacles, and other park and public site features with new features that are compatible in design, material, and scale with the District's historic character. The project replaces existing park benches, trash receptacles, and water fountain with new steel benches six feet in length; 35-gallon trash receptacles; and a fieldstone based water fountain. The project removes bleachers and replaces them with stone wall seating. The project removes wooden bollards and installs new bollards approximately three feet in height. (*Parks, West End Guidelines 2 and 3*)
- 6) The proposed project introduces new signage that is compatible in material, size, scale, and character with the District. The proposed project constructs new signage of traditional sign materials. The project installs fieldstone veneer and bronze medallion park signage at the main entrance that is six feet in height, 11 feet in width and six feet in thickness. (*Signage-General, West End Guideline 3*)
- 7) The proposed project replaces deteriorated light fixtures and introduces new site lighting based on accurate documentation of the original design or a new design compatible in human scale, appearance, location, design, material, finish, and scale to the historic character of the site and District. The Herwig #507 (option #1) pedestrian post and lantern is a new design compatible with existing light fixtures to be replaced. (*Lighting, West End Guidelines 2 and 3*)
- 8) The proposed project considers the scale of new plant materials in relation to the immediate surrounding environment. The project removes and replants trees,

shrubs and other plant materials to improve the overall vegetative, park setting. (*Vegetation, West End Guideline 4*)

- 9) The proposed project replaces deteriorated asphalt parking areas with parking that is compatible with the overall historic character of the streetscape and District. The project removes asphalt parking and replaces it with new asphalt parking design including granite curbing, landscaping and landscape islands. (*Driveways and Parking-General, West End Guideline 2*)

Staff Recommendation: Based on the preceding comments, staff recommends that the Commission grant a COA for comprehensive landscape/site alterations, installation of signage and park furniture at Hanes Park, 1404 W. Northwest Blvd (PIN#: 6825-67-7398.00), located in the West End Historic Overlay District, with the following conditions:

- 1) The applicant shall receive, prior to commencement of the work, all other required permits or permissions from governmental agencies.
- 2) Commission staff shall review and approve any revisions or deviations to any portion of the as-submitted work, that qualifies as minor work, prior to commencement of that portion of the project.
- 3) The applicant shall submit the Certificate of Appropriateness Request for Certification of Completed Work form and photo documentation of the completed project to HRC staff within ten (10) days of its completion.

Public Comment

Speaking in Favor of the Application: Scott Miller, 120 Club Oaks Ct., Winston-Salem, NC 27104, was sworn for testimony and spoke in support of the application. Mark Lively, 1417 Brookstown Ave, Winston-Salem, NC 27101, was sworn for testimony and spoke in support of the application. John Merschel, 3400 Paddington Lane, Winston-Salem, was sworn for testimony and spoke in support of the application. George Bryan, 1326 Glade Street, Winston-Salem, NC 27101, was sworn for testimony and spoke in support of the application. Laura Philips, 59 Park Blvd., was sworn for testimony and spoke in support of the application. Elizabeth Cayne, 214 N. Hawthorne Rd, Winston-Salem, NC 27104, was sworn for testimony and spoke in support of the application. Jeff MacIntosh, 129 Woodbriar Road, was sworn for testimony and spoke in support of the application. Will Knott, 424 Springdale Avenue, Winston-Salem, was sworn for testimony and spoke in support of the application.

Speaking in Opposition to the Application: None

Commission Discussion

The Commission discussed the application.

Mr. Allen moved that case COA2016-098 be continued to the February 1, 2017 meeting with a deadline of January 11, 2016 to submit materials based on the discussion and comments we've had today in our open session.

Second: Ms. Abernethy
Vote: Unanimous

III. **MINOR WORK APPROVAL AND OTHER REQUESTS REPORT (Enclosed in Commission Members Packet)**

IV. **COMMITTEE REPORTS**

A. **Education Committee: No Business to Report**

B. **Historic Marker Committee**

1. Marker Committee meeting
Wednesday, November 30, 2016, 4pm
Bryce Stuart Municipal Building, 2nd Floor Conference Room

Ms. Johnson provided an informal review of the marker committee meeting. The HRC requested a written report prior to the final approval of the selected 2017 markers.

V. **UNFINISHED BUSINESS**

- A. Update on the Local Historic Landmark applications and review process

Ms. McCullough presented the updated application. The HRC provided comment for proposed changes to the application.

VI. **NEW BUSINESS**

- A. Neighborhood Conservation Overlay (NCO) Review
Stratford Manor

Mr. Allen moved that the Commission find that the Stratford Manor neighborhood, roughly bounded by Vest Mill Road and Westbrook Plaza Drive and including the properties fronting on Hannaford Road and Fentriss Drive, in Winston-Salem, North Carolina meets the pre-application requirements to become eligible for a Neighborhood Conservation Overlay District and is a cohesive older neighborhood which does not appear eligible at this time to become an Historic or Historic Overlay District and therefore recommend that the area be submitted to the City-County Planning Board as eligible to become a Neighborhood Conservation Overlay District.

Second: Ms. Thacker
Vote: Unanimous

VII. **OTHER BUSINESS**

- A. Design Guideline Update Committee
Thursday, December 15, 2016, noon
- B. Update on County Architectural Survey

NEXT MEETING: January 4, 2017

This agenda is available in alternative media forms for people with disabilities. Individuals with disabilities who require assistance or special arrangements to participate in programs and activities of the Historic Resources Commission are encouraged to contact the Planning Department at least 72 hours in advance so that proper accommodations can be arranged. For information, call 336-727-8000 (727-8319 TTY).